MINUTES ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD RSA UNION STREET SUITE 370 MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA January 20, 2006

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. James Davis (Chairman)

Mr. Mandell Tillman

Mr. Clifford Odom

Mrs. Myra Pruit

Mr. Leston Stallworth

Mr. Jon B. Blissitte (Vice-Chairman)

Mr. Steve Martin

Mr. Thomas E. Garrett

OTHERS PRESENT:

Mrs. Lisa Brooks

Ms. Neva Conway

Mr. D.J. Dixon

Mrs. Carolyn Greene

GUESTS PRESENT:

Mr. Mike Adams (Certified Residential)

Mr. Chris Powers (Trainee)

Ms. Melissa Brogden (Trainee)

Mr. Lowell Roberts (Certified Residential)

- 1.0 With quorum present Mr. Davis, Chairman called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m. The meeting was held at the RSA Union Building, 100 N. Union Street, 3rd Floor Conference Room, Montgomery, Alabama.
- 1.1 The meeting was opened with prayer by Mr. Odom and then the Pledge of Allegiance.
- 2.0 Members present were Mr. Mandell Tillman, Mr. James Davis, Mr. Clifford Odom, Mr. Leston Stallworth, Mr. Steve Martin, Mr. Jon B. Blissitte, Mrs. Myra Pruit and Mr. Thomas E. Garrett.

Mr. Davis welcomed the guests and asked the Board members to introduce themselves.

3.0 On motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Stallworth the regular minutes for November 18, 2005 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

At this time Mr. Davis presented Mr. Tillman with a plaque in appreciation for his service to the Board as Chairman.

- 3.2 Ms. Conway informed the Board that the Ray Brannum appeal is still pending.
- 4.0 Ms. Conway informed the Board that our Senate Bill (SB47) was passed though the Senate and has now gone to the House. We are hoping to have it put on the Special Order Calendar. Ms. Conway asked the Board to contact their Legislators.

The Bill sponsored by Mr. Gregory Albritton was included in the books for Board information. Board has no opposition to this bill and will answer in favor of it if asked.

- On motion by Mr. Blissitte and second by Mr. Odom the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved: Charles R. Campbell, Bain B. Chapman, Brittney B. Crow, Donald C. Davis, Kelvin D. Gratton, Jr., Robert A. Harris, III, Robert D. Honey, James D. Hudson, Adam W. Ligon, Summer A. Maples, Mark N. Pannell, Eric W. Phillips, William J. Pilcher (Recip.)(GA), Alan R. Pitcher, John D. Ray, Edgar M. Reeves, Walker Reynolds, III, Shaunn E. Starling, Damon E. Wilkinson, Teresa Wright (Recip.)(GA), Steve G. York.
- 5.2 <u>State Registered Real Property Appraiser</u> application deferred: Michael J. Ward.
- 5.3 <u>Licensed Real Property Appraiser</u> applications approved: Brandon J. Beaird, Dennis Kern, Mark D. Kigerl. **Applications deferred:** William S. Baker, Randy G. Grayson, Lawrence G. Sides.
- 5.4 <u>Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser</u> applications approved:
 Brooks B. Autrey, Ethan Couch, David M. Hayes, Brett D. Hurst
 (Recip.)(GA), Faith A. Kaiser (Recip.)(NH), Kathy A. Mahoney
 (Recip.)(GA), William F. Nixon, Melissa A. Pugh, Melissa A. Tapia.

 Applications deferred: Gregory S. Dalton, Edward W. Dean, Melvin R.
 Mackey, Michael A. Manley.
- 5.5 <u>Certified General Real Property Appraiser</u> application approved: Charles C. Chatham (Recip.)(TN), Byorn N. Leo (Recip.)(KS), George M. Shanahan, Thomas A. Stark (Recip.)(TX). **Applications deferred:** Joseph W. Gattozzi, William D. Mackey.
- Mrs. Brooks discussed the financial report with the Board. Mrs. Brooks stated we were 25% into FY 06 and 21% into budget expenditures. Mrs. Brooks stated there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time. On motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Stallworth the Board voted to approve the Financial Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board requested that Mrs. Brooks schedule committee meetings for the Thursday before each Friday Board meeting.

At 9:00 a.m. Ms. Conway opened the Public Hearing on Administrative Rule Change 780-X-9 (Trainee/Mentor Policy).

The Board asked that the Mentor applications be sent to the Education Committee for review once they are received.

Mrs. Brooks and Ms. Conway will implement the application process.

Four appraisers attended the Public Hearing. Some of their comments were regarding the number of trainees a Mentor can supervise and trainees soliciting business. After the guests concluded their comments the Public Hearing was then closed. After much discussion on motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Martin the Board voted to accept the Trainee/Mentor Policy without changes. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

On motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Martin the following education courses and instructor recommendations were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated.

APPRAISAL INSTITUTE - CHICAGO

Initial Application:

(LIC)(CE) General Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 30 Hours – Traditional Classroom (Instructor: Joseph Rabianski) Both Course and Instructor Approved

LORMAN BUSINESS CENTER, INC.

Initial Application:

(CE) Eminent Domain - 6 Hours – Traditional Classroom (Instructor: James Baxter, Gene Garrett and Charles Isom) Both Course and Instructors Approved

REAE, REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL EDUCATION

Initial Application:

(CE) 2006-7 Hour USPAP Update (National Course) – 7 Hours – Traditional Classroom
 (Instructor: Dennis Greene)
 Both Course and Instructor Approved

With Mr. Garrett recusing, motion carried.

Mr. Odom reported that the Education and Communication Committees will be combined. The Committees were re-organized and the new list will be e-mailed to the Board members.

6.2 Ms. Conway informed the Board that there is no Disciplinary Report for this month.

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway informed the Board since last meeting the Board received 16 new complaints, 1 complaint was dismissed and 6 were settled with a total of 138 open complaints. The Board discussed the fact that we are down to only one investigator at this time.

Mr. Dixon included Investigation Division Reports that he compiled for Board information.

Complaint acknowledgement letters were included in the Board books for comment. The Board is in favor of dispensing with these letters. The Board asked Ms. Conway to research what action would be required by the Board to dispense with public notification of investigation results.

6.2.1 The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-62**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-63**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Summary **AB-05-68**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-69**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-78**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-79**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-80**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-81**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-82**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-92**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-125**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. With Mr. Davis recusing motion carried.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-165**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mrs. Pruit, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. With Mr. Davis recusing motion carried.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-24 Companion Case AB-05-23**: On motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Martin, the Board voted that Probable Cause does not exist and that this case be dismissed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-38**: On motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Blissitte, the Board voted that Probable Cause does not exist and that this case be dismissed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-87 Companion Case AB-05-88**: On motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Blissitte, the Board voted that Probable Cause does not exist and that this case be dismissed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

6.2.2 The Board reviewed anonymous complaint **AB-05-184.** On motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Blissitte the Board voted to initiate formal complaints. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed anonymous complaint **AB-06-01**. On motion by Mr. Garrett and second by Mr. Stallworth the Board voted to dismiss the complaint. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

6.2.3 The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Orders on **AB-05-31**. On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mr. Stallworth the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order as presented. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Order on **AB-05-35**. On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Blissitte the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order as presented. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Voluntary Surrender Consent Order on AB-03-77, AB-03-95, AB-04-79. On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mr. Garrett the Board voted to approve these Consent Settlement Orders as presented. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Order on **AB-04-33**. On motion by Mr. Garrett and second by Mr. Tillman the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order as presented. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- No reciprocal agreements to report since last meeting. Mrs. Brooks reported the Florida Board will meet in February at which time a Mutual Agreement with Alabama will be decided on.
- The following reciprocal licenses were issued since last meeting: Charles C. Chatham (G)(TN), Brett D. Hurst (R)(GA), Faith A. Kaiser (R)(NH), Byron N. Leo (G)(KS), Kathy A. Mahoney (R)(GA), William J. Pilcher (T)(GA), Thomas A. Stark (G)(TX), Teresa Wright (T)(GA).
- 7.0 The temporary permit report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 8.0 Mrs. Brooks included for Board information the resignation letter effective December 21, 2005 from Mr. Otis Stewart to Governor Riley.

Mrs. Brooks included a letter on behalf of L. Alexander McCall for a determination of the number of points issued on appraisals of timberland properties over 10,000 acres. The Board discussed that 10 points maximum are issued for timberland properties over 10,000 acres with the actual number of points issued determined when the individual appraisals are reviewed.

Mrs. Brooks included for Board information an e-mail received from Ms. Judith Haney about "Operation Quick Flip".

Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that Mrs. Greene has been appointed Executive Secretary to the Board.

Mrs. Brooks also informed the Board that the State Personnel Board had approved her position.

Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that Personnel was still analyzing the Investigator position and hopefully would have something to report at the March meeting.

Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that the final Trainee Orientation makeup session would be held Friday, February 3, 2006 at 9:00 a.m. in the State Capitol auditorium.

The USPAP course proposals from Ms. Melissa Cosby and Mr. Steve Morgan were included in the books for discussion. After much discussion on motion by Mr. Tillman and second by Mr. Garrett the Board elected to contract with Ms. Cosby to teach the 15-hour USPAP course. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Mr. Dixon took this time to discuss some issues of concern with the Board.

Ms. Conway discussed the letter from Mr. James A. McDonald regarding a new company, Appraisal Port. The Board decided to refer the matter to State Banking for their review and to notify Mr. McDonald that as long as he takes measures to protect the physical integrity of his report, there is nothing this Board can do about lenders requiring Appraisal Port as a delivery method.

A copy of correspondence between Ms. Conway, Mr. John Brenan of the Appraisal Foundation and Mr. Larry Disney, Director of the Kentucky Real Estate Appraisers Board regarding Scope of Work was included for Board information.

Copies of the Statement of Economic Interests Forms from the Ethics Commission were included in the Board books for their completion.

9.0 At 10:50 a.m. on motion by Mr. Blissitte and second by Mr. Garrett the Board voted to adjourn. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene Executive Secretary

	James Davis, Chairman	
APPROVED:		
CG		